

April 17, 2025

Dear

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for "Daddy & Dada" by Ryan Brockington in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. The concern about this title noted on the form was "sexualization/exploitation of children."

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, "will lead children to confusion about gender." I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book's viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library's Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in October 2021 and has circulated 4 times. It is published by Little, Brown, & Co. It is shelved in the youth picture book section because it is a picture book written for children ages 2-8.

Kirkus Reviews (kirkuksreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on March 16, 2021. The review reads:

A straightforward and nonjudgmental validation of many LGBTQ+ and other family structures.

Rumi wants you to meet her family. Rumi is 4, and she has two dads (the Daddy and Dada of the title), a little brother named Xander, and a dog named Betty. Daddy sings with her. Dada reads to her. (Xander likes to pull her hair.) Her friends have families of different types—some with a mom and a dad and others with just one parent. One boy in her neighborhood lives with just his grandmother and her cat. Rumi sees families of all sizes and makeups when she walks down the street with hers. She has two sets of grandparents (both seem to be heterosexual pairings). Her family also includes Uncle TyTy and Uncle RyRy (she danced at their wedding) and Aunt Katie and Uncle Jeremy and their kids. One of her friends calls Rumi her sister, and Rumi's dads think that is great because friends can be family too. Now Rumi wants to hear about your family. Brockington and Webster, who head a two-dad family themselves, have laid out a beautifully kidfriendly introduction to an early-21st-century constellation of family shapes told in a believable kid voice. May's simple, pleasant, smile-filled cartoon illustrations are colorful and show families that are not only varied by parent number (never more than two) and gender presentation, but also by race. One character uses a wheelchair; another wears a hijab. Rumi and her family all present White.

A straightforward and nonjudgmental validation of many LGBTQ+ and other family structures. (Picture book. 2-8)

Additionally, School Library Journal, a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on July 1, 2021. The review reads:

Written by real-life fathers and couple Brockington and Webster, this sweet and affirming picture book is a love letter to all kinds of families. On the title page, blonde, four-year-old narrator Rumi introduces herself to readers. The page turn presents Daddy and Dada, who are lovingly depicted with their arms around each other. Though Daddy and Dada interact with Rumi differently, they both love her "THIS much." Readers then meet the two other members of the family: baby Xander and dog Betty; all but Xander have very pale skin. For the rest of the book, Rumi ruminates on other types of families that she sees, ranging from two to nine family members (including pets). Rumi also expands her description of her own family to include grandparents, uncles, an aunt, cousins, and even a friend who calls her a sister. As her dads say, "Sometimes friends are just like family." In the final spread, Rumi asks readers about their own families. May's digital cartoon illustrations and the book's sunny tone make for a warm and inviting story. Readers looking for books that normalize LGBTQ+ families will be delighted that this inclusive title is matter-of-fact without needing to defend or overly explain. While the featured family is white, Rumi notices a diverse array of families with various skin tones (and one wheelchair user). For all its attempted inclusivity, however, it is disappointing not to see different body sizes represented as well.

VERDICT A positive, kid-friendly addition for all picture book collections. PreS-Gr 2.

CDL's Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that "Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent's right to supervise his/her children's choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions. Juvenile material may be labeled with non-prejudicial, viewpoint-neutral labels.

Review has deemed that a genre label of "social issues" is appropriate, and therefore has been applied to "Daddy & Dada."

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of "harmful to minors" in MCL722.674 sec.4. Therefore, "Daddy & Dada" will be retained in the youth picture book section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees PO Box 308 3688 N. Hartland Rd. Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL's Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert Director, Cromaine District Library