

Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address concerns about these materials.

Name _____

Address _____

City _____

Phone _____

Do you represent yourself: yes or an organization? (please specify): _____

1. Type of resource on which you are commenting:

Book (e-book) Audio Recording DVD Game
 Magazine/Newspaper Content of Library Program
 Other, please specify: _____

Title Galaxy: the prettiest star

Author/Producer/Presenter Axelrod, Jadzia

2. What brought this resource to your attention?

Patron concerned for children

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

Detailed summary

4. What concerns you about the resource?

Sexualization/exploitation of children

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

Removal

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.



June 19, 2025

Dear

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for “Galaxy: The Prettiest Star” by Jaddia Axelrod and Jess Taylor in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. I understand that a group of individuals helped you fill out these forms. We discussed at our second meeting that while each person filling out the forms selected that they represent themselves as an “individual” rather than “organization” because you are not a formal group, but a group of like-minded friends with similar concerns. You indicated that you may speak for the group and that I may communicate directly with you.

The concern about this title noted on the form was “sexualization/exploitation of children.”

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, “will lead children to confusion about gender.” I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book’s viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library’s Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in December 2022 and has circulated 6 times. It is published by DC Comics. It is shelved in the teen graphic novel collection, as it is a graphic novel written for ages 14-18.

REVIEW: Kirkus Reviews (kirkusreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on May 1, 2022:

Taylor struggles with hiding her secret. When the Vane attacked the planet Cyandii 6 years ago, its princess, Taelyr, fled to Earth. Now, in order to stay hidden, she must live as Taylor, a human boy who presents as White. Sacrificing her true self for the sake of safety doesn't feel right, but those in charge insist it's the best thing to do. When Taylor meets new student Katherine, a Black girl with a prosthetic leg, she begins longing even more to show her true self. To that end she steals the Ehsar, the device that turned her into a human and has the power to turn her back. In her true form as a young woman with purple skin and green hair, Taylor feels at ease in her body for once, free to pursue her growing feelings for Katherine. However, she risks discovery not only from the Vane, but those around her too. While Taylor is no superhero, she is likely to become a hero to transgender youth. Fear and rejection dog her footsteps, but Taylor shows that living a lie can be far more damaging than the risks that come with being true to oneself. With beautiful artwork that features expressive figures highlighted against abstract backgrounds and a narrative that first breaks, then repairs readers' hearts, turning the final page is a sad affair. A fantastical allegory that lends itself well to the graphic novel medium. (resources) (Graphic fantasy. 14-18)

CDL's Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that "*Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent's right to supervise his/her children's choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions.*

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of "*harmful to minors*" in [MCL 722.674 sec.4](#). Therefore, "Galaxy: The Prettiest Star" will be retained in teen graphic novel section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin
President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees
PO Box 308
3688 N. Hartland Rd.
Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL's Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert
Director, Cromaine District Library