

Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address concerns about those resources.

Name _____

Address _____

City _____

Phone _____

Do you represent yourself? or an Organization? (please specify): _____

1. Type of resource on which you are commenting: All formats

Book (e-book) Audio Recording DVD Game
 Magazine/Newspaper Content of Library Program
 Other, please specify: _____

Title Harley Quinn Breaking Glass: a ~~good~~ breakin; novel

Author/Producer/Presenter Tamaki Mariko

2. What brought this resource to your attention?

Parental Concern

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

Detailed Summary

4. What concerns you about the resource?

Sexualization/Exploitation of children

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

to move

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.



May 1, 2025

Dear

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for "Harley Quinn Breaking Glass" by Mariko Tamaki and Steve Pugh in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. The concern about this title noted on the form was "sexualization/exploitation of children."

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, "will lead children to confusion about gender." I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book's viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library's Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in November 2019 and has circulated 21 times. It is published by DC Comics. It is shelved in the teen graphic novel section, as it is a graphic novel written for ages 13-18.

REVIEW: Kirkus Reviews (kirkusreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on June 4, 2019:

Tamaki's (Laura Dean Keeps Breaking up With Me, 2019, etc.) version of Harley operates with a moral compass while still being bubbly and outgoing. Harley has been sent to live with her grandmother in Gotham City. She discovers her grandmother has died, but apartment manager Mama, a white, gay man who also manages the local drag queen bar, lets her stay. Harley finds her place among a colorful "mutiny of queens" and makes a new best friend, Ivy Du-Barry. Ivy, who is biracial (Chinese and black), carries the bulk of the load when it comes to educating Harley, who is white, about intersectionality, representation in media, and the gentrification of their neighborhood. Harley's happiness doesn't last—Mama receives news of an impending eviction and crosses paths with the Joker. Through flashbacks, shaded in orange, readers get a deeper understanding of what motivates her to fight for what she loves. Pugh (Supergirl, Vol. 3: Girl of No Tomorrow, 2018, etc.) uses a mostly gray and black color palette with background bursts of scarlet. When characters are truly in their element, their signature colors are used: a red and black scheme for Harley, shades of green for Ivy, and the Joker's signature purple. The fast-paced plot enhanced by Harley's trademark style of speech examines the impact of gentrification, and Harley's character development follows a redemptive arc that will have readers rooting for her and her colorful family. A riotous read. (Graphic novel. 13-18)

CDL's Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that "Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent's right to supervise his/her children's choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not

have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions.

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of “*harmful to minors*” in [MCL722.674 sec.4.](#) Therefore, “*Harley Quinn Breaking Glass*” will be retained in the teen graphic novel section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director’s decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin
President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees
PO Box 308
3688 N. Hartland Rd.
Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL’s Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert
Director, Cromaine District Library