

Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address

Name

Address

City

Phone

Do you represent yourself? YES or an Organization? (please specify) : _____

1. Type of resource on which you are commenting:

☒ Book (e-book) ☐ Audio Recording ☐ DVD ☐ Game
☐ Magazine/Newspaper ☐ Content of Library Program
☒ Other, please specify: GRAPHIC NOVEL

Title MAGICAL BOY, VOLUME 1

Author/Producer/Presenter TITE KAO

2. What brought this resource to your attention?

PARENTAL CONCERN FOR CHILDREN

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

THE BOOK IS PUSHING A LIFESTYLE THAT I OBJECT TO. "TO GET TO THE POINT, I'M A TRANSGENDER MAN."

4. What concerns you about the resource?

SEXUALIZED / EXPLOITATION OF CHILDREN

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

REMOVAL

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.

Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address concerns about those resources.

Name _____

Address _____

City _____

Phone _____

Do you represent yourself? yes or an Organization? (please specify): _____

1. Type of resource on which you are commenting: All Formats

_____ Book (e-book) _____ Audio Recording _____ DVD _____ Game

_____ Magazine/Newspaper _____ Content of Library Program

_____ Other, please specify: _____

Title MAGICAL BOY

Author/Producer/Presenter Kao

2. What brought this resource to your attention? CONCERN FOR CHILDREN

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

DETAILED SUMMARY

4. What concerns you about the resource?

Focus of Book on High School Students
SEXUALIZATION PROMOTING TRANS BOY

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

Removal

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.



June 19, 2025

Dear ,

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for “Magical Boy V.1” by The Kao in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. I understand that a group of individuals helped you fill out these forms. We discussed at our second meeting that while each person filling out the forms selected that they represent themselves as an “individual” rather than “organization” because you are not a formal group, but a group of like-minded friends with similar concerns. You indicated that you may speak for the group and that I may communicate directly with you.

Two separate challenge forms were submitted for this title. The concerns about this title noted on the form submitted by one person were “sexualized/exploitation of children” and “pushing a lifestyle that I object to. ‘To get to the point, I’m a transgender man.’” The concerns about this title noted on the form submitted by another person were “focus of book on high school students sexualization promoting trans boy.”

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, “will lead children to confusion about gender.” I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book’s viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library’s Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in February 2023 and has circulated 15 times. It is published by Graphix, an imprint of Scholastic Inc. (first published online in 2018 by Tapas). It is shelved in the teen graphic novel collection, as it is a graphic novel written for ages 12-17.

REVIEW: Kirkus Reviews (kirkusreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on Sept 14, 2021:

Descendant and heir to Aurora, the fallen Goddess of Light, a transgender boy reluctantly steps into his destiny of fighting monsters and guarding the world from an ancient evil. Biracial (White and Japanese) Max has two secrets that only his best friend, Jen, knows—his gender identity and his power to see colorful auras of emotion around people. On his 16th birthday, Max decides to come out to his parents as trans, but before he can explain, his mother reveals his magical lineage and insists that he take up the mantle of the Goddess of Light and do his part to protect the world. Monsters that feed on negative energy are already attacking, so Max must quickly embrace his emerging abilities in order to prevent destruction. The plot revolves around the binary of lightness, standing for good, and darkness, representing evil. Max is frequently misgendered and referred to by his deadname, and his powers force him into frilly clothes that cause him dysphoria. Even his father, Kai, who doesn't aggressively police his gender like his mother, Hikari, is little more than a bystander to the maternal abuse. The manga-style art is intensely expressive, but the page layouts are chaotic and sometimes hard to follow. Jen and Sean (an anime-style delinquent at Max's school) are the only primary characters depicted with brown skin. A fast-paced magical story whose protagonist endures intense transphobia. (Graphic fantasy. 12-17)

CDL's Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that *"Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent's right to supervise his/her children's choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions.*

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of *"harmful to minors"* in [MCL722.674 sec.4](#). Therefore, "Magical Boy V.1" will be retained in the teen graphic novel section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin
President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees
PO Box 308
3688 N. Hartland Rd.
Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL's Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert
Director, Cromaine District Library