

Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address concerns about the

Name
Address
City
Phone
Do you represent yourself, _____ or an Organization? (please specify): _____



1. Type of resource on which you are commenting:

- Book (e-book) Audio Recording DVD Game
- Magazine/Newspaper Content of Library Program
- Other, please specify: _____

Title BETWEEN THE PIPES

Author/Producer/Presenter ALBERT MCLEOD

2. What brought this resource to your attention?

PARENTAL CONCERN FOR CHILDREN

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

THE BOOK IS PUSHING A LIFESTYLE THAT OBJECTS TO IT CONTAINS STRONG HOMOSEXUAL THEMES AND PUSHES HOMOPHOBIA.

4. What concerns you about the resource?

SEXUALIZED / EXPLOITATION OF CHILDREN

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

REMOVAL

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.



May 1, 2025

Dear

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for “Between the Pipes” by Albert McLeod in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. I understand that a group of individuals helped you fill out these forms. We discussed at our second meeting that while each person filling out the forms selected that they represent themselves as an “individual” rather than “organization” because you are not a formal group, but a group of like-minded friends with similar concerns. You indicated that you may speak for the group and that I may communicate directly with you.

The concern about this title noted on the form was “sexualization/exploitation of children” and “pushing a lifestyle that I object to. It contains strong homosexual theme and pushes homophobia.”

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, “will lead children to confusion about gender.” I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book’s viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library’s Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in January 2025 and has circulated 2 times. It is published by HighWater Press, an imprint of Portage & Main Press. It is shelved in the teen graphic novel section, as it is a graphic novel written for ages 12-18.

REVIEW: Kirkus Reviews (kirkusreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on August 3, 2024:

A wholesome story about self-acceptance. Cree teenager Chase has two close friends, Kevin and Jade. His homophobic hockey teammate Leo continually picks on him for hanging out with Kevin, calling them boyfriends. School is hard enough already—add in feeling different from the other boys, and for Chase, it’s too much. He distances himself from Kevin and starts hanging out more with Jade, even trying to kiss her just to fit in. When the hockey team learns that a scout is coming to see them play, Chase decides to focus wholeheartedly on sports. As he pushes his friends away and lashes out at his grandmother, isolating himself, everything comes to a boiling point. The story focuses on Chase’s internal conflict: He dreams of a giant, imposing bear (which an elder explains is a symbol that can inspire “us to face our greatest enemy—ourselves”) as well as of worst-case scenarios in which he’s bullied by his teammates and coach. In reality, only Leo is outwardly hostile, and his school offers support for queer students, including running a gay-straight alliance and hosting a Two-Spirit filmmaker from Manitoba’s River Winds Nation; it’s largely Chase’s internalized homophobia that holds him back. The straightforward story, which prominently features shades of pink in the illustrations, also includes positive depictions of Indigenous culture, through acts of smudging and Cree vocabulary. Highlights the importance of community and cultural connection as roots for embracing one’s identity. (content warning, authors’ note) (Graphic fiction. 12-18)

The content warning referenced in the Kirkus review pertains to “homophobia and toxic masculinity.” In regards to the concern that the book “pushes homophobia,” an examination shows that this is not the case, and if anything, is anti-homophobic.

CDL’s Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that *“Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent’s right to supervise his/her children’s choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions.*

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of “*harmful to minors*” in [MCL722.674 sec.4](#). Therefore, “Between the Pipes” will be retained in the teen graphic novel section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director’s decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin
President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees
PO Box 308
3688 N. Hartland Rd.
Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL’s Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert
Director, Cromaine District Library