



Request for Reconsideration

The Library Board of Trustees has delegated the responsibility for selection and evaluation of collection materials and programming to the Library Director and has established reconsideration procedures to address concerns.

Name _____

Address _____

City _____

Phone _____

Do you _____



_____ for an Organization? (please specify) : _____

1. Type of resource on which you are commenting: All formats

- _____ Book (e-book) _____ Audio Recording _____ DVD _____ Game
- _____ Magazine/Newspaper _____ Content of Library Program
- _____ Other, please specify: _____

Title Firebird

Author/Producer/Presenter San mi

2. What brought this resource to your attention?

Patron concern for children

3. Have you examined the entire resource? If not, what sections did you review?

Detailed summary

4. What concerns you about the resource?

sexualization of children

5. What action are you requesting from the Library

Removal

Process: As outlined in the Library's Materials Selection Policy #3020: No material shall be removed from the Library's collection until all steps in the following process have been completed.

- A. Patrons ("Requester") who object to Library Materials will be sent to the Director.
- B. The Director will discuss the Library Materials in question with the Requester, attempting to resolve the concern to both the Requester's and Library's satisfaction.
- C. If the Requester wishes to carry the request further, the Director will provide the Requester with a copy of the Materials Selection Policy, including the Request for Reconsideration of Library Materials ("Request for Reconsideration").
- D. Once a completed, signed copy of the Request for Reconsideration is received, the Library Director shall decide the Request for Reconsideration, taking into consideration the Library's Materials Selection Policy and any other relevant information to reach a decision. The Director may consult with any other staff or consultants when making this decision.
- E. The Library Director shall send the decision in writing to the complainant within seventy-five (75) days of the receipt of the completed Request for Reconsideration form. If the decision is that the questioned material should be removed from the collection, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director and all copies of the item will be withdrawn. If the decision is that the questioned material is to be retained, the Requester will be notified in writing by the Library Director that the material will be retained.
- F. A written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.
- G. The Library Board serves as the final authority in cases involving retention or withdrawal of Library Materials.



April 24, 2025

Dear

This letter is in response to the completed Request for Reconsideration form for “Firebird” by Sunmi in the Cromaine District Library (CDL) collection. I understand that a group of individuals helped you fill out these forms. We discussed at our second meeting that while each person filling out the forms selected that they represent themselves as an “individual” rather than “organization” because you are not a formal group, but a group of like-minded friends with similar concerns. You indicated that you may speak for the group and that I may communicate directly with you.

The concern about this title noted on the form was “sexualization of children.”

When we met you explained to me that your main goal is to protect children from the subject matter of these particular books, which you broadly defined as containing viewpoints that, in your opinion, “will lead children to confusion about gender.” I explained to you that per library policy, only a parent may restrict what their own children read, and that public bodies may not restrict access to books based on the book’s viewpoint. You indicated that your personal views about gender confusion should take precedence over the rights of other parents in the community with whom you disagree.

After completing a staff review, I have concluded that this title was acquired in accordance with the library’s Materials Selection Policy #3010, which was provided when we discussed your concern in March 2025. This title was first available to community members in April 2024 and has circulated 10 times. It is published by HarperAlley (an imprint of HarperCollins Publishers). It is shelved in the teen graphic novel section, as it is a graphic novel written for ages 13-16.

REVIEW: Kirkus Reviews (kirkusreviews.com), a professional review source used by librarians when selecting titles, reviewed the title on May 24, 2023:

A Korean American teen’s stifled life changes when she makes an unexpected friend. When sophomore Caroline Kim agrees to peer tutor another student, she doesn’t expect it to be the outgoing, charismatic, and beautiful Korean and Filipina American senior Kimberly Park-Ocampo. The friendship that grows between them mirrors their slow-burn attraction, depicted through teasing dialogue, blushes, and emotive moments. As Caroline and Kim grow closer, the depictions of Caroline’s ongoing struggles with low self-esteem, anxiety, and self-consciousness about her body are masterfully woven into their romance. Similarly, Caroline’s complicated family dynamics with her mother, overseas father, and older sister are realistically shown, particularly her mother’s controlling and emotionally distant parenting style. By contrast, Kim works as a team with her mother to run the household, watch her younger siblings, and work side jobs while still being available for her friends. The stark contrast between the two teens, their families, goals, and experiences as Asian Americans creates intriguing thematic parallels. As Caroline discovers positive aspects of herself through her relationship with Kim, the firebird as a symbol of transformation is somewhat successfully depicted through red feather motifs that stand out from the largely black-and-white art. However, the story’s impact is diluted by haphazard flashback scenes. Despite an otherwise engrossing emotional journey, the finale peters out. Gripping and thoughtful, but the clunky ending disappoints.
(Graphic fiction. 13-16)

CDL's Policy #3010, Section V part B. notes that *"Responsibility for the reading material of children rests with their parents or legal guardians. Selection shall not be inhibited solely by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children. The Library respects each individual parent's right to supervise his/her children's choice of reading materials. However, the Library does not have the right to act in loco parentis (in place of the parent). Therefore, a parent who chooses to restrict the materials his/her children select must accompany those children when they use the collection to impose those restrictions.*

C. The Library Director is responsible for overseeing where the books are shelved and catalogued. However, the Library Board recommends that any materials that are appropriate for adults or older teens but may be considered harmful to minors, as defined by the Library Privacy Act, are shelved within the adult collection.

Review has deemed this content does not fit the definition of "harmful to minors" in [MCL722.674 sec.4](#). Therefore, "Firebird" will be retained in the teen graphic novel section of the library.

Policy #3010 provides a protocol to appeal of this decision in Section IX Part F: written appeal of the Library Director's decision may be made by the Requester to the Chair of the Library Board within ten (10) business days after the written decision is made by the Library Director. The appeal must include the specific Library Material being appealed and the reason that the Requester would like the decision reversed. Please direct an appeal to:

William Bolin
President, Cromaine District Library Board of Trustees
PO Box 308
3688 N. Hartland Rd.
Hartland, MI 48353

The Library Board will review any documentation it deems necessary to decide within sixty (60) days of receipt of the appeal. The Library Board may issue an additional extension if necessary in order to fully evaluate the material.

CDL's Board of Trustees delegates collection development responsibilities to the library director. A staff of librarians with advanced degrees and professional credentials make collection development decisions for CDL. Ultimately, however, the responsibility of what a child reads rests with parents and guardians. Public libraries cannot be expected to interfere with parental obligations and responsibilities when it comes to deciding what a minor may read, listen to, or view. It is the right of parent/guardian to determine what materials are available for their children to read.

The Cromaine District Library serves 30,000 people in Hartland Township and portions of Brighton, Deerfield, Genoa, Oceola and Tyrone Townships. Library patrons come from a wide variety of religious, political, ethnic, and social backgrounds. Members of our community are well educated and possess a broad range of interests. Not every item the library offers will be enjoyed by every reader, listener, or viewer, but there is something for everyone at the public library. I respect your personal taste in materials and encourage you to ask CDL librarians to recommend titles that more closely match your interests.

Best,

Sarah Neidert
Director, Cromaine District Library